

It should be noted that Sellars' UB thesis lucidly, if briefly and untechnically, anticipates much of what appeared in "Time and the World Order" (1962) and "Metaphysics and the Concept of Person" (1969), essays written in the notoriously unreadable style of his later work.

The 1934 essay has more than the usual significance of such early efforts because Sellars for many years suffered from a writer's block which prevented him both from completing his doctoral dissertations at Oxford and Harvard and from writing anything for publication until the now classic "Realism and the New Way of Words" (published in 1948 in Farber's *P&PR* when Sellars was 36 years old). Although he was a precocious philosophy student at Michigan, UB, Oxford and Harvard, there was no public record of his work until more than a decade after his UB essay. "Until 'Realism and the New Way of Words,'" he recalled, "my philosophical development took place in in foro interno, in the classroom and in private discussion."⁵ We can take pride in the fact that a UB M.A. thesis throws light on the philosophical development of one of the most important American philosophers of the twentieth century.⁶

Peter H. Hare

NOTES

1. "Autobiographical Reflections," in Hector-Neri Castaneda (ed.), *Action, Knowledge and Reality: Critical Studies in Honor of Wilfrid Sellars* (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1975), pp. 277-293. For a list of Sellars' publications through 1974, see pp. 349-353.
2. Ibid., p. 281
3. Ibid., p. 283.
4. Ibid.
5. Ibid., p. 293.
6. Sellars' widow has given permission for the publication of his Masters thesis in the *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society, A Quarterly Journal in American Philosophy*, with an introduction by Robert Evans, a former student of Sellars now on the faculty of the University of Minnesota at Duluth. Publication is expected in 1991.

**International Conference Brings 175 Registrants:
"The American Philosophical Tradition as Used and Interpreted in
Other Countries"**

Department Chair Peter Hare directed a conference for the seventeenth annual meeting of the Society for the Advancement of American Philosophy on March 1-4, 1990 at the Center for Tomorrow. Scholars from Canada, England, France, the People's Republic of China, the Soviet Union, Finland, West and East Germany, Poland, Japan, Greece, Scotland, Belgium, and the United States including Hawaii participated in the conference program. Dr. Hare, also president of the SAAP organization, delivered the Presidential Address, "Problems and Prospects in the Ethics of Belief." The conference brought together representative scholars interested in the American philosophical tradition.

The meeting began in the evening of May 1 with a talk, "Architect Frank Lloyd Wright and American Philosophy," in the Darwin Martin House (Wright house built in 1905). Saturday morning sessions were held in the Albright Knox Art Gallery where there was also a tour of the Gallery's collection of twentieth century American art. Before dinner on Saturday evening there was a tour of Niagara Falls. Following dinner was a dramatic performance, "An Evening with William James," produced by graduate student Tim Madigan.

The conference was funded by the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Marvin Farber Memorial Fund, the Federation Internationale des Societies de Philosophie, SUNY/Buffalo Conferences in the Disciplines, Faculty of Social Sciences, and the Department of Philosophy.

Alonzo Church to Receive Honorary Degree

Dr. Alonzo Church has accepted the invitation from SUNY at Buffalo to receive an honorary Doctor of Humane Letters on May 20, 1990. John Corcoran of the Philosophy Department initiated the process leading to the invitation. In addition Church will lecture to a conference in his honor on May 19, 1990. The other two principal speakers are Leon Henkin of UC Berkeley and Martin Davis of the Courant Institute at NY University. Henkin and Davis have made important contributions to mathematical logic and philosophy of mathematics; both are Ph.D. students of Alonzo Church at Princeton.

The title for the conference is "The Buffalo Symposium On Church's Contributions To Logic: Preconditions, Presuppositions, Ramifications," with the short title "Buffalo Church Symposium." Plans are being made to have the conference papers combined with other suitable papers into a volume to be edited by Corcoran with the assistance of Michael Scanlan (Ph.D., SUNYAB 1980) and to be published by Prometheus Books titled *Logic In America: The Church Inheritance and the Church Legacy*.

News of our Graduates from Dick Hull

Bernard Murchland (Ph.D. 1968) has been on the faculty of Ohio Wesleyan University since 1967 where he holds the Trumbull G. Duvall Chair in Philosophy. He is a former chairman of the department and the founding editor of the *Civic Arts Review*, a journal relating liberal learning to public life. His academic interests are primarily in the areas of the history of ideas and the philosophy of social values. He teaches courses in medieval and renaissance thought, existentialism, American philosophy, ethics and public policy, business ethics, technology and society, as well as the usual introductory courses. Dr. Murchland has published widely, most recently *Voices in American Education* (Prakken Publishers, 1990), and has been a Staff Associate of the Charles F. Kettering Foundation since 1980. In recognition of his writings on liberal learning, he was elected a member of Phi Beta Kappa in 1988.

Eugene Valberg (Ph.D. 1973) has had one of the more internationally varied careers of our alumni. His teaching posts have taken him from the University of New Orleans to California at Dominguez Hills to Nigeria, Kenya, Papua New Guinea, Lesotho and Johannesburg, South Africa. Gene is a great correspondent, writing long and intricate philosophical letters on every conceivable topic from native medicine and amulets to racism. One of the consequences of teaching in the third world has been that it has been impossible for him to get textbooks reliably. Hence, he has had to write his own and has produced works ranging from ethics to logic and critical thinking to philosophy of psychological concepts. Because employment has been often unstable and subject to the caprice and whim of others, Gene has had to develop several businesses as partial means of support. While in Nigeria he developed a process for extracting and condensing passion fruit juice, which he first began to sell to restaurants and hotels in Ibadan and later started to export to Great Britain. More recently he has developed a business cooking and distributing brownies (heretofore unknown in South Africa) to a similar clientele, confronting at times mystifying problems having their origins in changes in raw materials, crop failures, etc. Gene is currently circulating a manuscript on racism and racial differences to potential publishers in the US and elsewhere and also has a manuscript of an ethics text likewise in the pipeline.

Gene may be contacted as follows (kindly observe the precise address, using only his initials):

EV
3 Orbery Court
20 Pope St.
Bellevue 2198
Rep S. Africa

Chandana Chakrabarti (Ph.D. 1975) has a visiting appointment at the University of Delaware, where she teaches courses in Indian and Chinese philosophy and religion. She sees Kisor at APA Conventions and other times.

Kisor Chakrabarti (Ph.D. 1975) is a Visiting Fellow for the 1989-90 academic year at the Center for Philosophy of Science, University of Pittsburgh. Doing work in the original Greek and Sanscrit, he is working on a manuscript discussing the philosophy of science of the ancient Greek and Indian philosophers. He assures us that the ancient Indian philosophical texts are greater in volume than those in Greek and Latin together, and that there is an exceptionally fertile area for philosophical historical work there for anyone who would master Sanscrit.

Michael Tye (Ph.D. 1975) is now in the Philosophy Department at Temple University. He has just published a book, *The Metaphysics of Mind*, with Cambridge University Press. The Press's promotional statement reads: "In this provocative book, Michael Tye presents a new account of the metaphysical foundations of psychological discourse. The theory that he develops is a form of physicalism with respect to the mental in that it denies that there are any nonphysical mental entities. But it is a physicalism that rejects both the token identity theory and eliminative materialism. In place of these views, Tye advocates a generalization of the adverbial approach to sensory experience, the "operator theory." He applies this to the analysis of propositional attitudes, arguing along the way that mental statements do not involve reference to mental events or objects and therefore that causal statements about the mental are not to be regarded as asserting relations between events. This adverbial theory has the virtue of being both simple and systematic and is an important contribution to the philosophy of mind." Department of Philosophy, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA 19122. (215)446-7726.

Alan Soble (Ph.D. 1976) is currently tenured as an Associate Professor at the University of New Orleans. His third and fourth books, *Eros, Agape and Philia: Readings in the Philosophy of Love* (Paragon House, 1989) and *The Structure of Love* (Yale University Press, 1990) are just being published.

About the latter, reviewer Russell Vannoy has written a most complimentary review, a slightly condensed portion of which is here reproduced with his permission.

Soble wishes to defend eros-type love against a variety of charges that have been leveled against it by its agapist critics. Since eros love is grounded in a love of the beloved's admirable qualities--in Soble's terms, it is "property-based"--it is possible that these qualities could also be found in someone else. This, however, violates (a) the claim that the beloved is a unique and irreplaceable person; (b) that love should be constant and exclusive; and (c) that love should be altruistic rather than an appraisal of those qualities that benefit the lover. Eros-type love is also condemned (d) because such a love could be based primarily on the beloved's trivial, ephemeral qualities and (e) because eros-type love fails to recognize that a person is somehow more than the sum of his or her properties.

Soble's replies to these attacks are extensive and detailed. (a) Under certain conditions, an eros-type love could be constant and exclusive if, say, the lover could love only one set of properties and if only one person had them. (b) Erosic love need not be an egocentric appraisal of the beloved's qualities. Admiring someone's qualities, for example, is not the same thing as saying that the qualities satisfy egoistic needs. (c) The erosic lover can be said to love a person if a person is defined as a composite of qualities. Soble writes: "If x loves y erosically, x loves y the 'whole' person when x loves y for y's attractive properties S that outweigh y's defects D, and x loves y 'the person' when x's perception of S and D is accurate." Soble's claim about the whole person is that x may dislike some of y's properties without disliking y. Indeed, even if one could show that there is a metaphysically "transcendental self" over and above one's qualities, it would not make sense to say that we could love an invisible, unknowable entity. In response to (d) Soble grants that this is possible; there are irrational loves. But it does not follow that the erosic lover cannot use a criterion that will enable him or her to have a more satisfying and profound love-life: "Identity properties might seem to

fit the bill, but I doubt it; our characters are filled with, and defined by, silly properties from the moral point of view.... The best sort of erosic love will be based on x's autonomously chosen or formed preferences; rather than the special concern for love being justified only when x loves y in virtue of y's properties that are not superficial. It can be justified when x loves y in virtue of y's properties that mesh with x's preferences that are not superficial; i.e., are not unreflectively and uncritically allowed to operate in x's choice."

Soble also neatly turns the tables on the agapist and shows that agapic love is itself vulnerable to many of the attacks it makes against an erosic love and suffers other problems as well. There is no guarantee that it will be constant since it rests on a desire to bestow value. Desires can die or become too weak to lead to action. Nor can it guarantee exclusivity since someone with such a loving "nature" would likely bestow his love on many persons. Worst of all (for Soble) it is irrational in that it can't answer the beloved's query as to why she is loved. To say that she is loved because she is a "person" is quite unsatisfying since everyone is a person. The agapist can't answer the question, "Why me, rather than other persons?" Soble does not deny that some erosic loves can be irrational, but other erosic lovers can give reasons why they love rather than being driven by unconscious causal forces. (This is Soble's ideal lover.) Soble's rationalism is a constant theme of his book: "The lover and the beloved want to understand their love rationally; to make sure the other is loving for good reasons rather than out of despair or obligation; to find out whether the lover values in the beloved those qualities the beloved himself values; to inquire about the depth of the lover's self-reflection about the ground of her love; to discover what about himself has elicited this powerful (perhaps welcome, perhaps unwelcome) response."

Vannoy goes on to discuss Soble's treatment of Gellner's paradox:

If x loves y for her charming qualities, then if x later met z with those same qualities, he must also love z, thus violating the exclusivity criterion. Yet if he did not love z, he could not have loved y either. That is, if he did not love z's qualities as well, his attachment to y's qualities was shallow and capricious. Gellner himself...tried to resolve the dilemma by arguing that x would not love z since x's emotion is a unique "E-type" emotion like patriotism in which the reasons for loving are not generalizable to anyone else. In his consideration of Gellner's and others' resolutions of the paradox, Soble deals with a variety of elements of love's experience: exclusivity, unrequited love, concern, openness, joint interests, concluding that the only coherent solution lies along the lines of jettisoning the exclusivity requirement: "That some concern, some openness, and some joint interests are logically required for love seems right, but then the conclusion that love is logically exclusive is unattainable."

The subtlety and intricacy of Soble's arguments are impossible to summarize succinctly.... Indeed, Soble's arguments are often rather more interesting than his conclusions. Does his book have any relevance to our own love lives? He is neither unabashedly romantic...nor disillusioned.... He believes in personal love, and his book gives a sober appraisal of what we can reasonably expect and not expect of love. In this way we may perhaps have more sane and sensible and enduring loves."

Soble may be contacted at U.N.O. Box 1246, New Orleans, LA 70148, (504)286-6257 (O); (504)288-5275 (H).

Joseph Ferrandino (Ph.D. 1977) is now involved with his wife, Valerie Ferrandino Reed, and other associates, in Psychological and Employee Assistance Consultants, 1207 East Buffalo Avenue, Tampa, Florida 33603 (813)247-3306.

Randolph Feezell (Ph.D. 1977) has a tenured post at Creighton University in Omaha, and spent the fall, 1989 term as a visiting scholar in their Center for Health Policy and Ethics, working on a book of ethics dialogues. He writes that his son Travis is 21, and after graduating from the University of Wyoming next May with an Honors BA in English will go to the University of Edinburgh on a Rotary Foundation Scholarship to study medieval languages. He and Barbara have three other children: Evan (10, with a "sweet swing from the left side of the plate"), Tyler (3-1/2), and Allie (2). Barbara has finished an MS in Educational Administration and is back in an inner city first grade class. Randy also reports that his book of introductory dialogues has just been published, but that he is still "trying to find a publisher for the greatest juvenile baseball novel in history written by a philosophy professor." Randy can be reached at the Department of Philosophy and Religion, Creighton University, California at 24th Street, Omaha, Nebraska 68178 (402)280-2017.

Randy's recent book of *Philosophical Dialogues* was being avidly snapped up at the APA bookstalls in Atlanta last month. It is a highly readable work, consisting of seven dialogues between a philosophy teacher and a former student, on questions such as ethical relativism, the existence of the soul, vegetarianism, the nature of faith and reason, and other topics. One of our faculty read it and said it was as lively as any novel, but solidly argued and hard to put down!

William Yoder (Ph.D. 1978) and his wife, Mary, have opened a chiropractic practice in Utica as of March, 1987. Their address: Chiropractic Family Care, 312 Oriskany Blvd., Whitesboro, NY 13492 (315)736-3324.

James Lindemann Nelson (Ph.D. 1980) has taken a leave of absence from his tenured post at St. John's University in Minnesota to join the Center for Ethics and Humanities in the Life Sciences at Michigan State University. He is just finishing a project funded by the National Science Foundation and has a book contract with the University of Utah Press for a book on the ethics of exemplary animal research (to be out in the Spring of 1991). Jim's address: The Center for Ethics and Humanities in the Life Sciences, Michigan State University, C-201 East Fee Hall, East Lansing, Michigan 48824-1316 (517)355-7550.

Steve Knaster (Ph.D. 1983) writes that he has finished his law degree and stood the California bar exam. He is employed in the San Francisco law firm of Brobeck, Phleger and Harrison, a 400-attorney firm. He reports that he is involved in the "litigation float," trying out different practice groups, having chosen litigation as his area of practice (particularly securities litigation and appellate practice). "My goal is to try out the practice of law for at least a few years. After that, I will re-evaluate, assuming that all goes well and I can continue to work (Steve is recovering from a ruptured disc and back surgery.) I miss teaching, and at times I do think about returning to teach philosophy. I love the lifestyle of a college professor, enjoy interacting with students, and after having been in law I see what a low stress profession teaching is.... On the other hand, jobs are considerably more plentiful in law (I had a lot of job offers both in NY and SF.), and the pay is considerably more lucrative, especially significant for someone who has a lot of student loans to repay."

In preparation with Ken Barber, *Individuals, Identity and Individuation*.

In preparation, a book on *Texts: Their Nature and Interpretation*.

Also two other edited volumes in Spanish.

Kah-Kyung Cho reported:

Articles:

1. "Heidegger and the Return to the Origin", presented at the International Symposium, *Philosophical Actuality of Martin Heidegger*, Bonn, April 29, 1989, to appear in April 1990.
2. "Phenomenology as a Cooperative Task, Husserl-Farber Correspondence of 1937," 21 pages (7 pages Introduction, with Footnotes by Cho), to appear in the 50th Anniversary Double Issue of *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 1990
3. "Zur Idee der Verwahrung des Naturschönen" (On the Idea of Preserving the Beauty of Nature), presented at the International Symposium on *Nature, Technology and Art*, Saarbrücken, October 21, 1989, to appear in the Proceedings of the said title, Spring 1990.

Book:

Work in progress on "Critique of the Philosophy of Consciousness", aided by a research grant of Daewoo Foundation.

Newton Garver recently attended two interesting conferences. One was the 14th International Wittgenstein Symposium in Austria, where the theme was devoted solely to Wittgenstein for the first time in 12 years. Far from having a shortage of papers, as was feared, there was a plethora: After more papers than ever had been rejected, there remained 240 (instead of the usual 125) on the program! (The program format had, of course, to be revamped.) This vigorous research contrasts with discussion of Wittgenstein at APA meetings: Although there was a session with invited papers at Atlanta (LW's 100th birthday, after all), there is only one other Wittgenstein paper on the program, and there was only one at the Central Division meetings when I was on the Program Committee two years ago.

The other conference was November 10-11 at Saratoga Springs, organized by the New York State Martin Luther King, Jr., Institute on Nonviolence. New York is the first governmental body to establish an agency to promulgate the thought of King. The conference was a sort of inaugural, filled with reminiscences and august personages (Coretta Scott King, John Lewis, Stanley Lundine), and so plans and programs were not explained in much detail. There is, however, an "Advanced Programs in Education" component; and since King's doctoral work was in philosophy, there should be a role for philosophers to play. I have notes on what was said, if anyone is interested.

Dick Hull reports that, after a long "dry spell," he has recently published *Ethical Issues in the New Reproductive Technologies* (an edited reader, with case studies, published by Wadsworth). He has also been active for the past several years on the University's Animal Care and Use Committee and has written several editorials and letters on related topics for local and campus newspapers.

NOTE: The deadline for the next issue of the *Newsletter* is August 1, 1990. If you have news for an article, please contact Charlotte Hamilton. Alumni, please send us informational letters about your activities; send them to the Department of Philosophy, 607 Baldy Hall, SUNY at Buffalo, Buffalo, NY 14260.

